

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

Rista Ayudya Hapsari, Yudan Hermawan

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Sleman, Indonesia

*Corresponding author, e-mail: ristayudyahapsari@gmail.com

Abstract

Equivalency education programs serve as a crucial bridge for individuals marginalized by formal schooling. This study evaluates the equivalency education program at PKBM Insan Mandiri using the Kirkpatrick model (reaction, learning, behavior, and results). Employing a qualitative descriptive approach, data were collected via observation, documentation, and interviews with nine informants (four learners, four tutors, and one PKBM head). Data analysis utilized an interactive model of reduction, display, and conclusion drawing. Findings reveal that at the reaction level, learners express satisfaction with methods and tutor interactions. At the learning level, participants show improved knowledge, skills, and attitudes. At the behavior level, positive changes in discipline, responsibility, and social participation emerge. Finally, at the results level, the program demonstrates positive outcomes in supporting participants' academic and economic independence. Thus, the program plays a constructive role in human resource development. Recommendations include strengthening digital facilities and continuous tutor training to optimize learning outcomes.

Keywords: Program Evaluation, PKBM, Equality Education, Kirkpatrick, Qualitative Descriptive



This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

©2021 by author

Introduction

Although education is a constitutional right in Indonesia, socio-economic and geographic constraints continue to cause high dropout rates, as consistently highlighted by BPS data (Wiriani et al., 2025). This disparity makes equivalency education programs an essential alternative for marginalized individuals (Setiawan et al., 2025). Under Law No. 20 of 2003, non-formal education is legally recognized, positioning Community Learning Centers (PKBMs) as vital grassroots hubs (Pratiwi & Samudro, 2025). Through these equivalency programs, PKBMs act as a substitute or complement to formal schooling, providing equitable learning opportunities to ensure school dropouts can successfully resume and complete their education (Jannah, 2025).

Education is a fundamental right for every citizen that must be equitably accessible (Widyaswari et al., 2026). However, current realities indicate that numerous community groups still lack opportunities to pursue formal education (Suwartin A. Pateda, Abdul Rahmat, 2020). This disparity necessitates the implementation of equivalency education programs as an alternative solution and a bridge to provide learning opportunities for individuals marginalized by the formal education system (Djumena, 2016). These equivalency programs serve a strategic function in achieving educational equity, acting as a substitute, supplement, or complement (Anirowati et al., 2025). Non-formal education inherently functions to substitute, complement, and supplement formal schooling (Lukman, 2021). The primary objective of equivalency education is to provide equitable learning services, ensuring that every individual receives recognized opportunities to continue their education (Romdon & Abidin, 2024). The implementation of these programs assists school dropouts in acquiring education through a scheme designed for equalization (Masri, A.E. et al., 2022). This allows learners who have discontinued their formal schooling to resume their education through an equivalent pathway (Saidah, 2018). Furthermore, equivalency programs must employ appropriate pedagogical approaches tailored to the learners to ensure the successful realization of program objectives (Multisuandi et al., 2026).

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

The pedagogical approach employed is needs-based, realizing its strategic function through structured and flexible methods adapted to the learners' requirements (Delva Syara, 2026). This approach is inherently participatory, actively involving learners in the planning, implementation, and evaluation stages of the activities (Safitri & Fahmi, 2026). These components are interconnected, forming an inseparable and cohesive unit (Wandasari et al., 2024). By advancing to higher educational levels, learners can contribute to the sustainable improvement of human resource quality (Larasati et al., 2024). Nevertheless, the implementation of this approach is not without challenges, as various issues persist that can impact the desired outcomes (Adelia Razis Putri, 2026).

Preliminary observations at PKBM Insan Mandiri reveal specific challenges that reflect these broader execution issues. Initial assessments indicate that learners often struggle with inconsistent attendance due to conflicting occupational and familial obligations. Additionally, the institution faces infrastructure constraints, with specific classrooms lacking digital media and instructional props. The preliminary data also highlights low initial interest in learning, as many participants enrolled merely to acquire a diploma rather than to genuinely develop practical skills (Handayani et al., 2024). This situation indicates that the instructional process has not been fully effective in facilitating the attainment of expected competencies, both in terms of knowledge and skills. Consequently, there is a pressing need for a program evaluation framework that moves beyond measuring immediate learner satisfaction (Rosyanafi, 2024). It must also assess the transfer of learning into actual behavioral changes and tangible outcomes for the learners and their communities. Therefore, evaluating the extent to which equivalency programs have achieved their objectives is a critical step that organizing institutions must undertake (Nyoman Suarjana, Nyoman Dantes & Program, 2015).

One such institution organizing equivalency programs is the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center (PKBM). This specific location was selected for the study due to its unique participant characteristics predominantly working adults with familial obligations and observed implementation challenges, necessitating a closer look at actual program outcomes (Hajaroh et al., 2008). Given the community's needs, evaluating the effectiveness of the equivalency programs at this PKBM is imperative (Setiawan et al., 2025). In alignment with these observed needs, employing the Kirkpatrick evaluation model is highly relevant because the characteristics of the learners necessitate evidence of meaningful learning and disciplined behavioral changes. The learning process is expected to yield outcomes in the form of improved skills and cognitive paradigms (Abdul Hayyi, Muslihatun, Lalu Mukhlisin, Rabiul Awal, Hasanuddin, 2023). Furthermore, the evaluation aims to provide comprehensive feedback for the improvement of the curriculum, tutoring strategies, partnerships, and post-graduation support (Purbalingga & Simanjuntak, 2025). Utilizing the Kirkpatrick model positions the evaluation not merely as a tool to measure learning outcomes, but as a framework that examines classroom learning experiences to observe tangible impacts and results on the learners (Fadzilaturrehman & Nugroho, 2025). Program organizers cannot ascertain the level of program success and the necessary follow-up actions without conducting an evaluation (Dewi & Kartowagiran, 2018).

The Kirkpatrick evaluation model consists of four levels. These sequential levels are reaction, learning, behavior, and results (Farjad, 2012). This framework demonstrates the learning experience process as well as the impact that emerges after an individual participates in an equivalency program. This framework demonstrates the learning experience process as well as the impact that emerges after an individual participates in an equivalency program (Agustina, 2018). To operationalize this framework within the specific context of equivalency education, concrete indicators are established for each level to provide a clear basis for evaluation (Junanto et al., 2024). The reaction level evaluates learners' satisfaction regarding the instructional approach, curriculum relevance, and facility adequacy. The learning level measures the acquisition of knowledge and practical skills, specifically improvements in basic literacy, numeracy, and technical or entrepreneurial abilities. The behavior level assesses the transfer of these competencies into daily life, indicated by observable changes in learner discipline, responsibility, and social interaction. Finally, the results level evaluates the broader, tangible impacts of the program, such as academic advancement (equivalency exam performance), economic empowerment, and active community participation. Conceptual and applied studies on the utility of the Kirkpatrick model include: (1) assessing the quality of the learning experience (Levels 1–2), (2) examining competencies in real-world activities (Level 3), and (3) measuring final outcomes such as performance, certification, or occupational mobility (Level 4) (Alsalamah & Callinan, 2021). The behavior and results levels are considered external as they focus on the changes that occur after the completion of the program (Dalimunthe, 2022).

Method

The research design employs a qualitative research method. It aims to comprehensively explore and describe the evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center (PKBM) based on the four evaluation aspects of the Kirkpatrick Model: reaction, learning, behavior, and results. Field findings will be processed and systematically compiled into descriptive narratives using scientific language to ensure a clear, detailed, and comprehensive understanding for both researchers and readers (Wijayanti et al., 2024). The required research subjects are those directly involved in the program, enabling them to provide in-depth information regarding program implementation, reactions to it, the learning processes, behavioral changes, and the achieved outcomes (Shinta Ayu Lestari, AT. Hendrawijaya, 2023). The evaluation stages for reaction, learning, and behavior involve 4 learners and 4 tutors. Meanwhile, the results evaluation stage involves one head of the PKBM.

Data collection in this study was conducted through three primary techniques: observation, interviews, and documentation. In accordance with the qualitative research method and the utilized data sources, primary data was obtained directly from the source through direct observation within the Insan Mandiri PKBM environment to acquire a factual overview of the equivalency education program's implementation. Through this activity, the researcher observed various aspects related to the learning process, ranging from interactions between tutors and learners, the instructional methods employed, and the level of learner participation, to the facilities and infrastructure supporting the learning activities. Subsequently, interviews were conducted with relevant stakeholders at the Insan Mandiri PKBM. Data collection was carried out by observing, listening, and analyzing the learning process based on observation and interview guidelines derived from the Kirkpatrick evaluation aspects, thereby generating valid and profound information. These observations were systematically conducted over a period of eight days, comprising three sessions. Through this activity, the researcher observed various aspects related to the learning process, ranging from interactions between tutors and learners, the instructional methods employed, and the level of learner participation, to the facilities and infrastructure supporting the learning activities.

Secondary data was sourced indirectly from books, journals, archives, and institutional documents, including the PKBM profile, organizational structure, curriculum, activity schedules, as well as educator and learner data. This data serves to complement and corroborate the findings from the primary data. These documents act as authentic evidence that assists the researcher in verifying and interpreting the data obtained from the observations and interviews. Data validity was ensured using triangulation techniques to guarantee the trustworthiness and credibility of the data. Through this approach, the researcher compared and cross-checked the reliability of the acquired information by utilizing different times, methods, and instruments. This process encompasses: (1) comparing observational findings with information obtained through interviews, (2) differentiating between informants' statements in public and private settings, (3) assessing the consistency of informants' responses over time, and (4) examining the congruence between interview results and the contents of related documents. Source triangulation was performed by extracting information from diverse sources, such as observational results, interviews, institutional documents, archives, activity logs, and photographs of learning activities. This approach ensures that the collected data possesses a robust and verified foundation.

Secondary data was sourced indirectly from books, journals, archives, and institutional documents, including the PKBM profile, organizational structure, curriculum, activity schedules, as well as educator and learner data. This data serves to complement and corroborate the findings from the primary data. Data validity was ensured using triangulation techniques to guarantee the trustworthiness and credibility of the data. In practice, this study applied methodological and source triangulation to mutually verify specific findings. For example, to validate the finding regarding learners' improved discipline and motivation at the behavior level, the researcher cross-checked participants' self-reported enthusiasm during interviews with direct observational data of their active classroom participation. These primary findings were then further verified against objective institutional documents, specifically by examining the learners' daily attendance logs and assignment submission records. This practical approach ensures that the collected data possesses a robust and verified foundation, rather than relying on isolated claims.

Furthermore, methodological triangulation was employed by collecting data from the same source through various participatory observations, in-depth interviews, and documentation studies (Sugiyono, 2019). By applying methodological and source triangulation simultaneously, the researcher can strengthen data validity and ensure that the evaluation results referring to the Kirkpatrick Model's aspects of reaction, learning, behavior, and results accurately reflect the actual conditions of the learning program's implementation at the Insan Mandiri PKBM.

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

The data analysis utilized a qualitative descriptive approach following the interactive model proposed by Miles and Huberman (1994), which occurs continuously through data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The process began with data reduction, where raw transcripts and observation notes underwent an initial coding process to highlight key phrases regarding learner experiences. These codes were then organized into structured categorizations aligned with the Kirkpatrick model's four levels, leading to broader theme development to capture essential patterns like shifts in motivation and skill application. Next, during data presentation, these organized themes were compiled into descriptive matrices and narrative summaries, allowing researchers to clearly map the connections between instructional methods and behavioral changes.

Results and Discussion

A. Reaction Stage of the Equivalency Education Program at the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center Using the Kirkpatrick Model

The first stage of the Kirkpatrick evaluation is the reaction stage of the learners in the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri. This stage measures the extent of satisfaction with the implementation of the teaching and learning activities. To ensure an objective assessment, the reaction categories in this study are based on a qualitative rubric: **"Excellent"** indicates unanimous enthusiastic feedback and proactive engagement; **"Positive"** reflects general satisfaction, observable comfort, and statements of relevance; and **"Suboptimal"** denotes recurrent complaints or observed physical barriers to learning.

Table 1. Summary of Learner and Tutor Reactions toward Program Implementation

Evaluation Component	Evaluated Indicators	Data Source	Findings & Explicit Basis for Assessment	Category/Status
Instructional Approach	Flexibility, tutor approach (relaxed & humanistic).	Learner Interviews, Classroom Observations	Basis for "Positive": Learners explicitly reported comfort and high motivation. Observations confirmed relaxed body language and active questioning. Quote: "The tutors are very patient and the atmosphere is relaxed, making it easier to understand."	Positive
Curriculum Relevance	Practicality and alignment with daily life needs.	Learner Interviews, Document Analysis (Curriculum)	Basis for "Positive": Verified alignment between syllabus documents and learner feedback regarding real-world application. Quote: "The materials are very useful and can be directly applied to my daily work and small business."	Positive
Infrastructure & Facilities	Classroom facilities, digital media, instructional props.	Classroom Observations, Tutor Interviews	Basis for "Suboptimal": Direct observation of physical barriers to learning. Specifically, two classrooms lack digital media and props, leading to restricted access. Quote: "We are constrained by the lack of projectors and props in some rooms, which slows down the learning process."	Suboptimal (Constraint)
Social Environment	Tutor-learner interaction, support system, non-academic activities.	Participant Observations, Learner Interviews	Basis for "Excellent": Unanimous positive feedback regarding peer-to-peer support and proactive participation in non-academic activities, fostering a highly communicative environment.	Excellent

Based on these observed reactions, the learners successfully increased their learning motivation as the instruction met their relevant, beneficial needs and aligned with their goals. Interview results indicated that the participants' responses toward the ongoing learning process achieved their target needs, demonstrating a strong foundation for the subsequent learning stages despite the infrastructural limitations.



Figure 1. The educational process at the Community Learning Center

The instructional implementation was characterized by specific tutor behaviors that operationalized a flexible, relaxed, and humanistic approach. In this context, "flexible" was demonstrated through the tutors' willingness to accommodate the varying schedules of working learners and adjust instructional methods to suit individual learning paces. The "relaxed" atmosphere was evident in the non-authoritarian, two-way classroom dialogue where learners were encouraged to ask questions and express difficulties without fear of punitive measures or judgment. Furthermore, the "humanistic" approach was actualized by tutors actively acknowledging the learners' adult responsibilities and prior life experiences, positioning themselves as supportive facilitators rather than traditional lecturers. This supportive environment significantly enhanced learner satisfaction regarding learning achievements. Building on this approach, activities were carried out using learning materials relevant to daily life, focusing not only on theory but also incorporating practical elements that could be directly applied. These materials motivated participants to continue learning, as they felt the knowledge gained had direct benefits in improving their quality of life (Hidayati, 2025).

Nevertheless, some learners still encountered difficulties and constraints during the learning process. They stated that supporting infrastructure and facilities for learning remained insufficient. Specifically, two classrooms lacked instructional props, digital learning media, and learning materials that were universally accessible to all learners, which posed a challenge during the reaction stage, leading to suboptimal learner satisfaction. This deficiency directly impacted the quality of learning across the first two levels of the Kirkpatrick model. At the reaction level, the absence of engaging digital tools and adequate visual aids diminished learners' initial enthusiasm and overall comfort in the classroom environment. At the learning level, these infrastructure constraints hindered knowledge acquisition and skill development, as participants struggled to fully comprehend practical concepts and digital competencies that heavily rely on hands-on media and interactive props. In response to this, the PKBM management optimized the utilization of existing facilities and resources by organizing group learning and discussions, while leveraging the surrounding environment as an instructional medium.

Another issue influencing the reaction stage involves the interaction between tutors and learners, as well as the motivation provided by tutors. The relationship between tutors and learners fosters a sense of comfort and facilitates the instructional process. The rapport between tutors and learners at PKBM Insan Mandiri is characterized by an open, communicative, and multi-approached engagement. Tutors act not merely as educators but also as facilitators and motivators who assist in resolving difficulties faced by learners during the instructional process. Learners felt motivated by the supportive environment at PKBM Insan Mandiri. Activities extended beyond the classroom to include skill training, learning motivation seminars, and social activities that further inspired the participants. This aligns with the reaction stage of the Kirkpatrick evaluation, which examines satisfaction and motivation regarding program utilization. Consequently, when participants feel satisfied and motivated, they exhibit a stronger commitment to the learning process until its completion.

Despite these limitations, the learners remained highly enthusiastic, engaged effectively in learning, and demonstrated enhanced learning motivation. This initial stage of the Kirkpatrick model indicates that PKBM Insan Mandiri has successfully fostered positive perceptions among learners, serving as a foundational step toward the overall success of the equivalency program. Their satisfaction levels and feedback can be utilized to rectify remaining deficiencies while sustaining the positive aspects identified by the participants (Tamsuri, 2022).

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

B. Learning Stage of the Equivalency Education Program at the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center Using the Kirkpatrick Model

Table 2. Matrix of Learning Outcomes (Knowledge, Skills, and Attitudes)

Dimension	Evaluated Indicators	Concrete Evidence from Field Findings	Achievement Status
Knowledge	Basic literacy (reading, writing, arithmetic).	Learners master basic calculations using practical daily themes (e.g., budget management).	Achieved
Skills	Technical & entrepreneurial skills (pastry, handicrafts).	Production of economically valuable products; some learners initiated Pre-Order (PO) sales.	Achieved
Attitude	Self-confidence and independence.	Restored academic confidence; learners feel prepared for equivalency exams and higher education.	Achieved

The second stage is the learning stage, which evaluates the academic achievements of learners participating in the equivalency program. This stage focuses on the improvement of knowledge, skills, and attitudes that occur throughout the instructional process. Observing how participants can contribute through shifts in mindset and lifelong-learning-oriented actions underscores the vital importance of their understanding and cognitive frameworks within the equivalency program. Interview results revealed that the learners were able to comprehend the core instructional concepts. They successfully followed and acquired basic foundational skills comparable to formal education, such as reading, arithmetic, and writing. In this context, tutors utilized accessible and simplified approaches, using daily activities to explain learning concepts. For instance, tutors designed simple mathematical lessons centered on buying-and-selling activities and personal budget management. This approach facilitated the learners' understanding of the material by connecting it to their real-world experiences. Additionally, learners were equipped with life skills education, encompassing entrepreneurship concepts, digital literacy, and inter-group communication. This broader exposure expanded their understanding beyond purely academic subjects and encouraged a rich exchange of experiences between learners and tutors.

Examining the skill dimension in the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri provides evidence of its tangible impact on the participants' capabilities. Through practical activities and training, learners directly apply what they have learned. For example, in monthly entrepreneurial workshops, participants are taught to manufacture simple products, such as pastries, snacks, and economically viable handicrafts. This process aids learners in developing creative and productive thinking capacities for entrepreneurship. Consequently, some participants have begun to establish small businesses or utilize a Pre-Order (PO) system within their residential areas. These outcomes signify that the instructional process has effectively fostered independence and creative thinking among the learners. Beyond these technical skills, participants acquired social competencies, enabling them to work collaboratively in groups and build self-confidence through the products they developed. Ultimately, the program aims to enhance functional knowledge for social utility, shifting the focus from merely obtaining a diploma to comprehensively building human character (Rienovita et al., 2025).

Learning outcomes were measured objectively through various evaluation methods implemented by PKBM Insan Mandiri, including written tests, individual assignments, group discussions, and portfolio assessments. To illustrate these achievements concretely, baseline assessments indicated that participants initially struggled with core competencies, recording an average initial score of approximately 60 across foundational subjects. Following the instructional period, subsequent evaluations demonstrated that the learners successfully understood the material and achieved significantly improved grades, with final average scores rising to 82. Furthermore, portfolio assessments showcased tangible progress in practical abilities; for instance, learners progressed struggling with basic bookkeeping to independently creating monthly financial reports for their small businesses]. Supported by this concrete data, learners stated that they comprehended the subjects better than before and felt more prepared to face the equivalency exams. This indicates that the learning process was not only effective in boosting academic performance but also in preparing learners to pursue higher education levels and confidently enter a highly competitive workforce.

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

The excellence of PKBM Insan Mandiri is also evident in its application of the andragogical approach, which positions learners as subjects possessing unique experiences and distinct needs. Tutors tailored their roles to match learner requirements and facilitated the instructional process so that participants could discover the personal relevance of the studied material. Consequently, this approach significantly enhanced student enthusiasm and active engagement. In line with the principles of the Kirkpatrick model, emphasizing the measurement of changes in knowledge, skills, and attitudes serves as a tangible indicator of the success of the learning stage at PKBM Insan Mandiri.

This demonstrates that PKBM Insan Mandiri has achieved its primary instructional objective: helping learners regain self-confidence and fundamental competencies equivalent to formal education. From the perspective of the Kirkpatrick model, this achievement constitutes a crucial foundation prior to the behavioral change stage, which assesses the extent to which the completed instruction is actively implemented in daily life. With the improvement of knowledge, skills, and positive attitudes, it can be affirmed that the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri has made a tangible contribution to community empowerment through sustainable non-formal education.

C. Behavioral Change Stage of the Equivalency Education Program at the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center Using the Kirkpatrick Model

Table 3. Behavioral Changes and Implementation Variations among Learners

Behavioral Aspect	Prior to Program	After Enrolling in Program	Empirical Evidence (Observations & Frequency)	Adaptation Pace / Constraints
Discipline & Responsibility	Tendency to procrastinate; lack of structural obligation.	Respect for time; routine and enthusiastic class attendance.	Observation: Attendance logs indicate that 4 out of 4 interviewed learners maintained a consistent presence and arrived on time.	Fast (Driven by tutor motivation).
Learning Culture	Enrolled solely for administrative formalities (diploma).	High initiative; requests independent study using PKBM facilities.	Observation/Interview: 2 learners were documented requesting extra access to PKBM facilities outside regular hours for independent study.	Moderate (Requires continuous encouragement).
Social Interaction	Insecure (minder); communication difficulties.	Confident in public speaking; active in group dialogues and empathy.	Observation: Field notes show all 4 learners actively led group discussions and presented tasks in front of peers without hesitation.	Fast (Driven by participatory methods).
Overall Adaptation	N/A	Positive behavioral changes maintained.	Interview: 75% of the informants self-reported that they continue to apply these disciplined habits in their daily work and home environments.	Slow for some individuals due to work/family obligations.

The third stage is behavior, focusing on the extent to which learners are capable of applying the knowledge, skills, and independent attitudes acquired from the learning process. It evaluates whether the outcomes of the instructional process have been effectively implemented in the learners' real lives. This stage assesses more than just material comprehension; it examines behavioral changes in how learners work, interact, and conduct their daily activities. The equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri regards behavioral change as a primary indicator of program success. Interview results revealed that learners experienced significant behavioral shifts after participating in the program. Notably, there was an increase in discipline and responsibility regarding both their studies and daily activities. Prior to joining the program, some learners admitted to procrastinating on tasks and failing to engage properly with educational activities due to the absence of academic obligations. However, following the implementation of the program and regular learning sessions at the center, these attitudes began to subside. Learners became increasingly enthusiastic and respectful of time, showing commitment to attending classes regularly. This behavioral change is a direct result of the disciplinary values instated through structured learning experiences and the consistent motivation provided by the PKBM Insan Mandiri tutors.

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

In addition to discipline, positive shifts were observed in the learners' growing academic motivation and drive for self-development. Initially, many participants enrolled in the equivalency program merely to acquire a diploma; however, over time, they began to realize that the learning process possesses intrinsic value beyond administrative formalities. This transformation was largely driven by the tutors' contextual teaching methods. As one learner expressed, *'I originally enrolled just to get the certificate for work, but when the tutors taught us using real-life examples like managing a small business, I actually found myself wanting to learn more for my own sake.'* This enthusiasm extended to acquiring new knowledge, both theoretical and practical. Notably, some learners even requested independent study sessions outside of regular hours, utilizing the available facilities at the center. A tutor corroborated this shift, highlighting the influential factors: *'When we connect the academic materials directly to their daily struggles and economic needs, they stop seeing studying as a chore. The practical relevance is what sparks their initiative.'* This indicates that the tutors' motivational strategies successfully cultivated a sustainable learning culture among the participants.

Furthermore, behavioral changes manifested in the learners' communication skills and social interactions. Exhibiting heightened confidence and expressiveness, they no longer felt insecure or hesitant when interacting with peers from diverse educational backgrounds. This transformation was driven by classroom habits where they actively discussed topics, engaged extensively in group projects, and participated in skill-building workshops. Consequently, they became more confident in public speaking, capable of expressing opinions articulately, and respectful of diverse viewpoints. The tutors' deployment of a participatory approach fostered an open, dialogic atmosphere in the classroom, which ultimately nurtured respectful behavior and high social empathy. The primary goal of non-formal education extends beyond expanding content knowledge; it serves to build character and enhance learners' ability to adapt and contribute positively to their social environment (Rio Friyadi, Supratman Zakir, 2025).

Despite the generally positive findings, behavioral changes did not occur consistently across all participants. Some learners required more time to adjust to the learning environment, particularly those balancing heavy occupational or familial responsibilities. Variations in individual support systems also posed obstacles to the implementation of new behaviors in daily life. To address this, the management of PKBM Insan Mandiri continuously strives to provide mentorship and ongoing motivation to ensure that every participant can sustain their enthusiasm and maintain the positive behavioral changes developed during the teaching and learning activities.

D. Results of the Equivalency Education Program at the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center Using the Kirkpatrick Model

Table 4. Comprehensive Impact Assessment (Kirkpatrick Level 4)

Impact Dimension	Specific Target Outcomes	Actual Impact Observed	Sustainability Status
Academic Advancement	Equivalency exam performance.	Significant increase in final exam scores compared to baseline assessments.	High Impact
Economic Empowerment	Practical implementation of skills.	Creation of micro-enterprises, generating new local economic opportunities.	Sustainable
Social Contribution	Community participation post-graduation.	Graduates act as community organizers and non-formal education volunteers.	High Impact
Institutional Response	Mitigating educational disparities.	Fostering community awareness regarding the vital importance of education.	Long-term Contribution

The fourth stage of the Kirkpatrick model evaluates the results or impacts experienced by program participants individually and environmentally following the instructional process. At PKBM Insan Mandiri, this evaluation aims to assess the degree to which the equivalency program yields concrete results in improving learners' competencies, independence, and overall quality of life. To capture these medium- and long-term impacts, this study operationalizes these concepts into specific indicators: **"competence"** is measured by academic advancement, specifically the performance improvement in final equivalency exams; **"independence"** is assessed through economic empowerment, notably the learners' ability to apply practical

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

skills to create sustainable micro-enterprises; and **"quality of life"** is evaluated by social transformations, such as graduates participating post-program as community organizers or non-formal education volunteers. Interview data revealed that the evaluation of the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri demonstrated a significant increase in learner competencies. Through structured learning activities and guidance from experienced tutors, participants successfully mastered core instructional concepts. The equivalency exam results, tailored to the learners' needs, indicated clear success, marked by a substantial increase in final scores compared to initial baseline assessments. This achievement reflects not only cognitive advancement but also demonstrates that the participatory and relevant pedagogical approaches were highly effective in helping participants apply knowledge contextually.

Beyond academic outcomes, the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri focuses heavily on developing practical skills aligned with community and workforce demands. Through entrepreneurship workshops, digital literacy sessions, and creative training, learners acquired tangible skills to improve their standard of living. Specific observational and interview data indicate that three out of the four interviewed participants successfully scaled these skills into active micro-enterprises. These ventures primarily focus on the production of homemade pastries, catering snacks, and local handicrafts. According to the learners' self-reported financial progress during the interviews, these micro-enterprises have been operating continuously for over six months generating an average additional monthly income of approximately Rp 200,000 to Rp 500,000. This provides concrete proof that the program is generating new economic opportunities. These sustainable skills can be directly and practically integrated into their daily lives, ensuring long-term financial independence.

The outcomes of the reaction stage fell into a positive and constructive category, with learners reporting that the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri offered genuine benefits. Learners' study attitudes and behaviors underwent a transformation after enrolling in the program. Initially, they felt insecure and left behind due to their inability to pursue formal education. However, the program began building their self-confidence and motivation by offering flexible learning within a supportive, inclusive atmosphere. Tutors played an indispensable role by providing extensive moral support and engaging approaches, which led to improved student discipline in class attendance, active participation in discussions, and a keen interest in completing assignments. This positive disposition indicates that the success indicators of the learning stage in the Kirkpatrick model were met, specifically regarding the attitudinal shifts necessary to sustain the learning process (Hidayat et al., 2023).

However, these achievements were accompanied by a primary constraint: limited learning time. Demographic data from the program indicates that 80% of the 25 enrolled equivalency program participants are actively employed and bear heavy familial responsibilities. Consequently, documented attendance patterns revealed that average learners missed two out of eight scheduled sessions per month. They were unable to attend instructional sessions consistently, which was corroborated by an informant who stated, "I often have to skip the afternoon classes because my work shift extends unexpectedly". This inconsistency caused some to face difficulties in comprehending the material. Additionally, looking back at the reaction stage, infrastructure limitations, such as inadequate digital media and instructional props, remained an issue. In this regard, tutors played a vital role in pacing the lessons appropriately to ensure all participants could keep up without falling behind, necessitating creative instructional strategies to overcome these bottlenecks. The results of the learning stage indicate that participants not only acquired new, beneficial insights but also honed their skills while fostering positive attitudes toward academic endeavors. The equivalency program successfully established a conducive learning environment tailored to real-world needs, allowing participants to study comfortably according to their respective capacities. To further enhance learning effectiveness, greater support for infrastructure and facilities is required. Additionally, tutor competencies must be continuously upgraded, as this directly influences the quality of learners' adaptation to subsequent educational processes.

Furthermore, the equivalency program positively impacted social competence and adaptability within the community. By engaging in group activities and social projects, participants learned to solve problems collaboratively and support one another. Upon graduation, numerous participants began playing more active roles in community affairs, acting as community organizers and educational volunteers in their residential areas. This demonstrates that the program successfully cultivates socially conscious and community-minded individuals, moving beyond purely academic proficiency.

These achievements were realized by overcoming numerous challenges. Based on the evaluation using the Kirkpatrick model, it can be concluded that the results and overall impact of the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri received a highly positive response from the informants, both in terms of competency

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

enhancement and participant independence. For these specific learners, the benefits extended beyond individual academic growth, enabling them to positively participate within their immediate local surroundings. Within the context of this specific study, the equivalency program demonstrated a constructive role in supporting targeted community empowerment and addressing the localized educational gaps of its participants. The ultimate impact of the program is measured not merely by these participants' success in securing an equivalency diploma, but by the extent to which they can sustainably apply the knowledge gained at PKBM Insan Mandiri to their real lives (Gouvany et al., 2024) (Gouvany et al., 2024).

Finally, the evaluation indicates that the majority of learners are capable of maintaining the positive habits formed during the program, with high levels of discipline, responsibility, and academic motivation persisting post-program. This confirms that PKBM Insan Mandiri delivers a sustainable, long-term impact rather than a temporary one. The degree of behavioral change among participants can be categorized as good, successfully fostering enduring positive habits. Theoretically, these outcomes reinforce the overall effectiveness of the equivalency program. Through the four interconnected stages of the Kirkpatrick model, the success of the program at PKBM Insan Mandiri can be evaluated comprehensively. The most prominent outcome is the development of competent, self-assured, and socially useful individuals. The observable long-term impact includes increased social participation and heightened community awareness regarding the importance of education. In conclusion, the equivalency program at PKBM Insan Mandiri has not only achieved its primary educational targets but has also made a substantive contribution to sustainable human development.

Conclusion

The evaluation of the equivalency education program at PKBM Insan Mandiri confirms that the institution effectively meets the specific needs of its learners. By applying the four-level Kirkpatrick model, this study extends beyond traditional assessments of basic knowledge acquisition and participant satisfaction. The framework's comprehensive approach highlights the program's deeper contributions, revealing its success in translating academic instruction into tangible behavioral changes—such as improved discipline and personal responsibility and concrete outcomes like socio-economic independence. Ultimately, the evaluation demonstrates that this equivalency program functions not merely as an alternative educational platform, but as a vital mechanism for practical community empowerment. To further optimize these outcomes, it is recommended that stakeholders address the identified instructional constraints by prioritizing the enhancement of digital learning facilities and providing continuous pedagogical training for tutors.

The evaluation of the equivalency education program at PKBM Insan Mandiri confirms that the institution effectively meets the specific needs of its learners. By applying the four-level Kirkpatrick model, this study extends beyond traditional assessments of basic knowledge acquisition and participant satisfaction. The framework's comprehensive approach highlights the program's deeper contributions, revealing its success in translating academic instruction into tangible behavioral changes, such as improved discipline and personal responsibility, alongside concrete outcomes like socio-economic independence. Ultimately, rather than merely serving as an alternative educational platform, the evaluation demonstrates that the program functions as a practical mechanism for community empowerment by demonstrably restoring participants' self-confidence, equipping them with essential basic skills, and fostering active social participation within their local environments. To further optimize these outcomes, it is recommended that stakeholders address the identified instructional constraints by prioritizing the enhancement of digital learning facilities and providing continuous pedagogical training for tutors.

Acknowledgment

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to the Head, management, and staff of the Insan Mandiri Community Learning Center (PKBM) for granting institutional permission, data access, and administrative support during the data collection process. Sincere appreciation is also directed to the tutors and learners who participated as research subjects and generously shared their experiences regarding the program evaluation. Additionally, the authors extend their thanks to colleagues and academic peers who provided valuable feedback and critical comments to enhance the clarity and quality of this manuscript.

References

- Abdul Hayyi, Muslihatun, Lalu Mukhlisin, Rabiul Awal, Hasanuddin, H. M. (2023). *EVALUASI PROGRAM PENYELENGGARAAN PENDIDIKAN KESETARAAN PAKET C DI LEMBAGA PENDIDIKAN NONFORMAL* Abdul. 6.

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

- Adelia Razis Putri, R. F. (2026). *Pencapaian Standar Kompetensi Lulusan pada Pelatihan Hantaran Melayu di PKBM Insan Cendikia*. 3(10).
- Agustina, A. (2018). *EVALUASI PROGRAM PENDIDIKAN KESETARAAN PAKET C VOKASIONAL DI PUSAT KEGIATAN BELAJAR MASYARAKAT (PKBM) BHINA SWAKARYA KABUPATEN BANDUNG (Aplikasi Evaluasi Program model Hammond)*. 9, 118–125.
- Alsalamah, A., & Callinan, C. (2021). *education sciences Adaptation of Kirkpatrick 's Four-Level Model of Training Criteria to Evaluate Training Programmes for Head Teachers*.
- Anirowati, L., Rahma, S., & Komariah, N. (2025). *EDUCATION EVALUATION MODELS MODEL-MODEL EVALUASI PENDIDIKAN*. 1(3), 133–145.
- Asyifa Ervira Masri, Ghina Putri Rusmayadi Muhammad Praditya Andreansyah, Y. M. A. (2022). *Evaluasi Program Pendidikan Kesetaraan Paket B Di Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat Al-Kahfi Asyifa*. 8(24), 216–227.
- Dalimunthe, M. B. (2022). *Kirkpatrick Four-level Model Evaluation : An Evaluation Scale on the Preservice Teacher 's Internship Program*. 6(2), 367–376.
- Delva Syara, R. F. (2026). *Analisis Implementasi Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan Kesetaraan Berdasarkan 8 Standar Nasional Pendidikan di PKBM Dahlia Pekanbaru*. 3(9), 192–200.
- Dewi, L. R., & Kartowagiran, B. (2018). *An evaluation of internship program by using Kirkpatrick evaluation model*. 4(2), 155–163.
- Djumena, I. (2016). *IMPLEMENTASI MODEL PEMBELAJARAN ORANG DEWASA PADA MAHASISWA PENDIDIKAN LUAR SEKOLAH FKIP*. 1(1), 11–18.
- Fadzilaturrahma, I., & Nugroho, R. (2025). *Penerapan Empiris Model Kirkpatrick Empat Tingkat dalam Pendidikan Informal: Pelatihan Barista di PKBM Perkotaan Intan*. 14(2), 251–257.
- Farjad, S. (2012). *The Evaluation Effectiveness of training courses in University by Kirkpatrick Model (case study : Islamshahr university)*. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46, 2837–2841. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.05.573>
- Gouvany, A. L., Siregar, H., & Darmawan, D. (2024). *Penerapan Model Kirkpatrick dalam Evaluasi Program Pelatihan Kepemimpinan Perempuan di Pusat Pengembangan Sumber Daya Wanita Pasoendan Digdaya*. 4(3).
- Hajaroh, M., Andriani, L., Tri, W., Utami, P., Sholikhah, E., & Utami, A. N. (2008). *Advancing Professional Competence Of Teachers Via Classroom Action Research*. 132–138.
- Handayani, N., Humaira, H. F., Firnando, J., Jauchar, B., & Suhendra, A. (2024). *Model Kirkpatrick Sebagai Metode Mengukur Hasil Pelatihan Responsibility Dalam Berorganisasi*. 6(1), 51–72.
- Hidayati, N. A. M. (2025). *Evaluasi Workshop Peningkatan Kemampuan Penyusunan Perencanaan Pembelajaran Bermuatan Literasi Keagamaan Lintas Budaya (LKLb) Menggunakan Model Kirkpatrick Pada Guru*. 6.
- Jannah, N. (2025). *Analisis Faktor-faktor Penyebab Tingginya Angka Putus Sekolah (Studi Kasus di Desa Tanjung Baru Petai , Ogan Ilir)*. 531–544.
- Junanto, S., Tuanaya, R., Shofa, M. F., Muntaha, M., & Permatasari, L. (2024). *Learning evaluation of the study group of Packages C programme in Sragen Regency*. 28(1), 1–14.
- Larasati, S. W., Gumay, F. D., Azizah, N., Riansyah, A., Septiani, W., Formal, P. N., Keguruan, F., Sultan, U., & Tirtayasa, A. (2024). *Evaluasi Program Kesetaraan Paket C di PKBM Al-Kahfi Menggunakan Model Evaluasi Bebas Tujuan*. 10, 86–94.
- Lukman, A. I. (2021). *DIKLUS : Jurnal Pendidikan Luar Sekolah Pemberdayaan Masyarakat melalui Pendidikan Nonformal di PKBM Tiara Dezzy Samarinda Community Empowerment through Non-Formal Education in Tiara Dezzy Community Learning Center Samarinda*. 2(September), 180–190.
- Multisuandi, N. N., Qur, S., & Septiani, P. (2026). *Pelatihan Pendidikan Kecakapan Hidup Melalui Keterampilan Tata Boga di PKBM AL-Kahfi Kota Serang Banten*. 12(1), 56–65.
- Nyoman Suarjana, Nyoman Dantes, I. N. N., & Program. (2015). *EVALUASI PELAKSANAAN PROGRAM PUSAT KEGIATAN BELAJAR MASYARAKAT (PKBM) DI KECAMATAN GEROGKAK*. 5.

Evaluation of the Equivalency Education Program at PKBM Insan Mandiri Using the Kirkpatrick Model

- Pratiwi, S. A., & Samudro, B. (2025). *Enhancing educational access through non-formal equivalency education: a study at a community learning center in indonesia*. 14(2), 90–99.
- Purbalingga, F. A., & Simanjuntak, M. V. (2025). *Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Kegiatan Pembelajaran Pendidikan Kesetaraan Paket A, B Dan C di Rutan Kelas IIB Prabumulih*. 5062–5070.
- Rienovita, E., Ragawaluya, A. A., Arifin, Z., & Indonesia, U. P. (2025). *Implementation of Kirkpatrick Model in Boarding Training Evaluation at BBPVP Bandung*. 21(1), 147–160.
- Rio Friyadi, Supratman Zakir, D. I. (2025). *Evaluasi Program Daurah (Pelatihan) Tahsin di Markazul Quran Bukit Tinggi Menggunakan Metode Kirkpatrick*. 2(1).
- Romdon, Z., & Abidin, Z. A. (2024). *IMPLEMENTASI MODEL KIRKPATRICK DALAM EVALUASI PELAKSANAAN PROGRAM P5 KEWIRAUSAHAAN DI SMK PGRI 3 KOTA BOGOR*. 4(1), 100–105.
- Rosyanafi, R. J. (2024). *PENERAPAN METODE MIND MAPPING UNTUK MENINGKATKAN HASIL BELAJAR PAI KEJAR PAKET C*. 19(20), 114–137. <https://doi.org/10.17977/um041v19i12024p114-137>
- Safitri, N. A., & Fahmi, R. (2026). *Pengendalian Mutu Program Pendidikan Kesetaraan Berdasarkan Standar Nasional Pendidikan di PKBM Cahaya Ilmu Kota Pekanbaru*. 3(9).
- Saidah, R. (2018). *Evaluasi pembelajaran kesetaraan Paket C dalam meningkatkan kualitas lulusan*. 12(2), 60–71.
- Setiawan, A., Susanti, S., Subaedah, S., Masyarakat, B., Amanah, G., Sei, P., Kabupaten, T., Masyarakat, P., Pendidikan, F. I., Medan, U. N., Kunci, K., Evaluasi, M., Keterampilan, P., Kegiatan, P., Masyarakat, B., Model, E., Empowerment, C. S., & Learning, C. (2025). *Model Evaluasi Keterampilan Berbasis Pemberdayaan pada Kelompok Belajar di PKBM Generasi Amanah*. 11(1), 1–6.
- Shinta Ayu Lestari, AT. Hendrawijaya, I. F. H. (2023). *Implementasi Program Desa Suco Produktif Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Sumber Daya Manusia Desa Suco Kabupaten Jember*. 7(2), 8–19.
- Suwartin A. Pateda, Abdul Rahmat, M. Z. (2020). *EVALUASI PROGRAM MODEL KICKPATRICK PADA DIKLAT BERJENJANG DI KABUPATEN GORONTALO*. September, 121–128.
- Tamsuri, A. (2022). *Literatur Review Penggunaan Metode Kirkpatrick Untuk Evaluasi Pelatihan Di Indonesia*. 2(8).
- Wandasari, H., Loekman, A. S., Pratiwi, A. E., Indah, N., Kusuma, L., Masyarakat, P., Siliwangi, U., Masyarakat, P., Siliwangi, U., Masyarakat, P., Siliwangi, U., Masyarakat, P., Siliwangi, U., Model, P. E., & Pendahuluan, I. (2024). *Evaluasi Program Kesetaraan Paket C Berbasis Model*. 2(2).
- Widyaswari, M., Qodriyati, T. U., & Susanto, S. F. (2026). *Ethno-Project-Based Learning as a Community-Based Education Model for Preserving the Cultural Heritage Monica*. 13(1), 73–87.
- Wijayanti, L., Syahid, A., Dewi, R. S., Masyarakat, P., Karawang, U. S., & Barat, J. (2024). *EVALUASI PROGRAM KESETARAAN PAKET C DI SANGGAR KEGIATAN BELAJAR KOTA BEKASI*. 7(4), 135–144.
- Wiriani, E., Puspita, E. A., & Ahmad, A. (2025). *Optimalisasi Program Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM) Dalam Menurunkan Angka Putus Sekolah di Desa Alue Dua Kota Langsa*. 4(1), 12–18.